

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 078 331

CG 008 129

AUTHOR Johnson, Ralph H.; And Others
TITLE Evaluating Counselor Effectiveness Fact or Fallacy--Counselors Relate Equally Well to All Students.
INSTITUTION Minneapolis Public Schools, Minn. Dept. of Guidance Services.
PUB DATE 73
NOTE 13p.
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Counseling Effectiveness; Counselor Evaluation; Counselor Performance; *Evaluation; Evaluation Techniques; Measurement Techniques; Minority Groups; Noncollege Preparatory Students; *Secondary School Students; *Student Attitudes; Student Needs; Student Opinion; Surveys

ABSTRACT

In order to investigate counselor effectiveness in urban secondary schools, guidance personnel developed a ninth grade and a twelfth grade Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. Data collected were processed for city-wide and individual school results. Items dealing with help received and the reaction of students to their relationship with counselors were tallied as to student responses by sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of interactions with counselors. Results show two trends: (1) minority students responded more positively than others; and (2) noncollege-bound students responded more positively than college bound. Little consistent difference was evident based on sex and on achievement level. Implications of the resulting data include the following: (1) individual counseling programs can be studied from the students' point of views, (2) staff development programs for counselors can be more efficiently planned to meet student needs; and, (3) student priorities concerning counseling services can be readily identified. (Author/SES)

Minneapolis Public Schools
Department of Guidance Services

EVALUATING COUNSELOR EFFECTIVENESS

FACT OR FALLACY--COUNSELORS RELATE EQUALLY WELL TO ALL STUDENTS

Prepared by:

Donald M. Peterson - Counselor at Roosevelt High School
JoAnne M. Wilson - Counselor at Folwell Junior High School
Ralph H. Johnson - Director of Guidance Services

Problem and Hypotheses. In the spring of 1971 several Minneapolis counselors discussed ways to obtain feedback from students regarding counselor effectiveness. Counselors were also concerned about negative comments relating to their counseling services. Of particular consequence are remarks indicating that counselors were not relating consistently to all groups of students and that counselors were not available, knowledgeable, or helpful. To investigate counselor effectiveness in Minneapolis secondary schools, personnel in the Department of Guidance Services, with counselor input particularly from those who served as junior and senior high department chairmen, developed a Ninth Grade and a Twelfth Grade Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. The purpose of the administration of this questionnaire was to determine, through actual student response, how counseling effectiveness was viewed by students using the services.

The following hypotheses were formulated:

1. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the number of student-counselor interviews.
2. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statement regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's sex.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

ED 078331

CG 008 129

3. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to student's race.
4. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's post high school goal.
5. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's school marks.

Design. The Counseling Accountability Questionnaires were administered in the spring of 1971 to 76 percent of the 9th grade students and a 22 percent sample of the 12th grade students in 25 of the 28 Minneapolis junior and senior high schools and in the spring of 1972 to over 80 percent of the 9th grade students and over 80 percent of the 12th grade students in 27 of the 28 Minneapolis junior and senior high schools (approximately 4,500 per class).

Minneapolis students in Grades 9 and 12 in the spring of 1971 and 1972 were asked to complete the Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. They did not sign their names but were asked to designate their sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of times they had interacted with their counselors. Subjective comments were invited.

Data collected was processed for city-wide and individual school results. Items dealing with help received and reaction of students to their relationships with counselors were tallied as to student responses by sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of times interacted with counselors.

Results. Representative graph results indicate that the criticisms of questions of counselor effectiveness that initiated this study were not borne out by the data. No significant difference was found to exist in student response to questionnaire statements for either grade 9 or grade 12 for either the 1971 or 1972 administration for any of the hypotheses with the exception of the first hypothesis. As the number of individual interviews increased, the responses were significantly more positive.

Although no significant difference was found for the other hypotheses, there was a trend evidenced from many questionnaire statements that minority students responded more positively than others and that noncollege-bound students responded more positively than the college bound. Little consistent difference was evident based on sex and on achievement level generally.

From the administration of these questionnaires and the resulting data came the following findings and implications:

1. Areas of strength and weakness for city-wide and each individual secondary school counseling program can be studied from the student's point of view.
2. Minority and non-college-bound students were as effectively served by counselors as the majority and college-bound students.
3. Staff development programs for counselors can be more efficiently planned to zero in on unmet student needs.
4. Priorities concerning counseling services as seen by students were identified.
5. Individual counselors can examine their effectiveness.
6. Item analysis of questionnaire item has implications for the delivery of guidance and counseling services.

DATA SHOWN IS UNWEIGHED IN PERCENTAGES ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST PERCENT

TABLE

		1971										1972																		
		Interaction					Sex		Race		Goal		Interaction					Sex		Goal										
							Total	Male	Female	White	Non-white	College	Non-College						Total	Male	Female	White	Non-white	College	Non-College					
1. Don't want subjects to take							757	19	45	227	246	150	324	407	630	124	339	341	2493	49	144	815	1085	336	1187	1271	2221	110	1116	1007
Yes							53	21	31	50	54	73	55	52	53	56	47	58	35	40	53	63	66	59	58	59	61	59	61	61
Didn't want or need							40	74	60	43	39	25	40	39	40	37	45	35	55	50	41	51	27	35	36	36	30	39	39	
Wanted but didn't get							05	05	01	07	06	02	03	07	06	04	07	05	08	08	05	04	05	05	05	04	04	04	04	05
No response							01	30	05	01	01	01	01	02	01	03	01	02	02	02	07	01	01	01	02	01	02	01	02	
2. Set a program example																														
Yes							34	35	40	51	75	34	63	60	68	61	65	65	20	42	57	71	71	64	65	63	63	63	63	65
Didn't want or need							27	47	31	26	13	11	23	22	22	22	25	24	63	41	20	20	17	26	26	22	27	27	27	27
Wanted but didn't get							03	00	18	14	07	05	08	09	01	06	10	06	14	16	11	06	10	13	11	11	11	11	11	11
No response							01	00	02	01	01	01	01	00	01	03	00	02	02	01	03	05	02	02	02	02	02	02	02	02
3. Set a college representative																														
Yes							18	00	07	12	17	32	20	16	16	33	30	19	04	06	10	21	34	16	12	12	12	12	12	12
Didn't want or need							72	79	73	73	72	59	71	74	76	52	62	72	92	83	71	70	56	73	73	72	73	73	73	73
Wanted but didn't get							07	21	16	03	07	05	07	07	06	10	07	05	02	08	05	04	05	05	05	04	04	04	04	04
No response							03	00	00	02	04	04	03	03	02	05	01	04	02	03	04	05	05	05	05	04	05	03	03	03
4. Set a vocational-technical school representative																														
Yes							10	05	04	11	05	15	10	11	10	13	03	12	02	06	10	13	15	12	11	11	11	11	11	11
Didn't want or need							32	74	91	31	33	77	82	82	84	70	93	81	96	89	83	80	77	80	80	83	83	83	83	83
Wanted but didn't get							05	21	04	06	04	05	05	04	04	10	02	04	00	03	04	03	05	04	04	03	03	03	03	03
No response							03	00	00	02	04	03	03	03	02	07	02	03	02	03	03	04	04	03	03	03	03	03	03	03
5. Set information about a job or an apprenticeship																														
Yes							10	05	16	17	16	25	20	18	19	13	13	21	16	15	16	23	30	19	23	21	25	14	23	23
Didn't want or need							61	74	71	73	73	64	67	72	70	70	80	67	76	78	74	65	57	69	66	68	76	61	61	61
Wanted but didn't get							05	21	11	09	08	09	10	07	03	10	05	08	08	05	07	08	10	13	13	13	15	07	07	07
No response							04	00	02	02	03	03	02	03	03	07	02	03	00	02	03	04	03	04	03	03	05	03	03	03
6. Apply for admission to a college or vocational-technical school																														
Yes							51	11	12	12	12	62	56	40	50	39	72	51	06	15	46	59	60	52	51	51	51	76	51	51
Didn't want or need							41	71	71	71	71	35	39	47	48	50	22	45	86	70	48	35	74	42	42	42	42	42	42	42
Wanted but didn't get							05	21	12	12	12	07	04	06	06	06	05	07	06	06	04	04	04	04	04	04	04	04	04	04
No response							05	00	02	02	03	03	02	03	03	07	02	03	02	02	03	04	03	04	03	03	03	03	03	03

DATA FROM 13 QUESTIONS IN PERCENTAGES ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST TENTH PERCENT

	Interaction		Sex		Race		Education		Interaction		Sex		Race		Education	
	Yes	No	Male	Female	White	Non-white	College	Non-College	Yes	No	Male	Female	White	Non-white	College	Non-College
7. Apply for financial aid																
Yes	26	00	27	26	24	37	44	11	24	00	23	25	23	45	41	10
Didn't want or need	62	84	61	63	65	47	45	77	92	85	68	66	68	42	49	84
Wanted but didn't get	08	16	09	03	08	12	09	08	06	09	06	06	05	08	07	03
No response	04	00	03	03	03	04	02	04	02	01	03	03	03	05	03	03
8. By arranging for me to attend a career or another important meeting																
Yes	15	00	17	15	15	16	14	16	06	04	14	14	14	24	17	13
Didn't want or need	76	79	74	77	77	67	31	73	92	88	78	79	80	63	77	81
Wanted but didn't get	05	21	07	05	05	10	04	07	06	05	04	03	04	07	02	04
No response	04	00	03	03	03	07	01	04	02	03	04	03	03	06	03	03
9. Feel better about coming to school																
Yes	18	05	19	17	17	24	11	25	06	07	15	12	12	19	09	15
Didn't want or need	72	34	74	70	73	62	82	63	92	84	77	79	80	67	84	76
Wanted but didn't get	07	11	04	03	03	09	05	09	06	06	04	05	04	05	03	04
No response	03	00	03	03	03	05	02	03	04	03	04	03	04	05	03	04
10. With a personal problem																
Yes	20	05	16	22	19	24	15	24	12	06	13	13	12	15	03	15
Didn't want or need	72	34	75	69	73	62	79	65	78	66	70	78	80	65	83	76
Wanted but didn't get	05	11	04	05	05	04	03	06	05	05	04	05	04	05	04	04
No response	07	00	04	03	03	10	03	05	04	03	04	03	04	05	03	04
11. Learn about my abilities and interests																
Yes	71	05	71	73	71	77	77	75	61	66	67	68	67	73	73	73
Didn't want or need	57	79	60	55	53	43	64	52	37	31	59	59	62	45	53	56
Wanted but didn't get	03	16	06	03	07	03	07	03	03	11	03	03	03	16	03	03
No response	04	00	03	03	04	07	02	05	03	01	03	03	03	06	03	03
12. Make an important decision																
Yes	31	11	32	29	29	38	29	32	64	61	66	66	65	31	64	66
Didn't want or need	59	74	60	53	61	49	63	56	37	36	63	63	65	46	63	63
Wanted but didn't get	07	16	04	03	07	04	06	07	06	03	03	03	03	14	03	05
No response	03	00	03	04	03	09	02	05	04	02	03	04	03	06	03	04

1972

ERIC
Full Text Provided by ERIC

Introduction

2006

! 247 2

Interaction

١٠

2000

Barriers

→---

1. Learn more about my abilities & interests

Yes

Don't want or need
wanted but didn't get

No response

opportunities

Yes

Didn't want or need
started but didn't s

:10 Response

What subjects to take
Yes

didn't want or need

reacted but didn't
No response

а) программа с:

Didn't want or need

water but didn't get
no response

about or participate

Some thing special
Yes

At the time of the

REPLY: The author has not
No reference

ON TO THE

SECRET

2. If any of these
statements are not correct

REPORT

Director, Office of
Public Affairs

[illegible]

didn't have or need
started out didn't get

No response

(DATA REPORT IS EXPRESSED IN PERCENTAGE ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST WHOLE PERCENT)

		1971		1972							
		Interaction	Sex	Race	Marks						
1. with a personal problem											
Yes	16	05	10	26	18	19	18	24	15	21	25
Didn't want or need	74	86	83	67	76	73	75	68	80	71	61
Wanted but didn't get	05	07	04	05	04	06	05	06	03	06	10
No response	03	09	07	02	03	02	02	02	02	02	03
2. Make an important decision											
Yes	41	05	24	37	32	29	30	37	29	13	33
Didn't want or need	62	83	63	56	60	63	63	55	66	58	57
Wanted but didn't get	04	01	04	04	04	05	04	05	03	06	09
No response	04	09	03	02	03	03	03	05	02	03	05
3. Contact a person who would help me											
Yes	14	06	08	20	15	14	13	26	12	17	20
Didn't want or need	89	81	85	73	78	79	80	62	82	76	66
Wanted but didn't get	04	04	04	05	05	04	04	07	03	06	09
No response	04	09	03	03	03	03	03	05	02	03	05
4. Feel better about coming to school											
Yes	13	05	09	17	15	12	13	21	10	17	16
Didn't want or need	77	83	74	74	77	30	80	67	84	74	64
Wanted but didn't get	04	04	04	05	04	04	04	06	02	05	17
No response	04	09	04	03	04	03	03	06	04	03	06
5. Carry about me											
Yes	47	22	38	56	45	47	47	43	51	44	45
No	07	09	06	05	07	07	07	07	06	07	10
Didn't know	45	68	53	37	44	46	45	43	42	48	44
No response	01	01	01	01	01	01	01	02	01	01	01
6. Is a person I can trust											
Yes	65	37	59	71	64	67	67	63	69	63	52
No	10	05	09	11	10	10	09	13	27	11	19
Didn't know	21	56	31	13	26	23	24	22	23	24	26
No response	01	01	01	01	01	01	02	02	01	01	01
7. Is easy to get on to see											
Yes	77	82	40	54	63	47	67	63	69	63	52
No	17	17	33	36	33	35	34	36	31	35	37
Didn't know	7	17	25	09	17	16	17	17	16	15	19
No response	02	01	01	02	01	01	02	05	01	01	01

(DATA SHOWN IN EXPENSES IN PARALLELS FOUND IN THE FOLLOWING TABLES)

		Interaction		Sex		Race		Work	
		Interaction		Sex		Race		Work	
		Total		Total		Total		Total	
		Never		Never		Never		Never	
		Once		Once		Once		Once	
		2 + 3		2 + 3		2 + 3		2 + 3	
		4 + 10+		4 + 10+		4 + 10+		4 + 10+	
		Male		Male		Male		Male	
		Female		Female		Female		Female	
		White		White		White		White	
		Non-white		Non-white		Non-white		Non-white	
		A & B		A & B		A & B		A & B	
		C		C		C		C	
		D & F		D & F		D & F		D & F	
		Total		Total		Total		Total	
		Never		Never		Never		Never	
		Once		Once		Once		Once	
		2 + 3		2 + 3		2 + 3		2 + 3	
		4 + 10+		4 + 10+		4 + 10+		4 + 10+	
		Male		Male		Male		Male	
		Female		Female		Female		Female	
		White		White		White		White	
		Non-white		Non-white		Non-white		Non-white	
		A & B		A & B		A & B		A & B	
		C		C		C		C	
		D & F		D & F		D & F		D & F	
		Total		Total		Total		Total	
		Never		Never		Never		Never	
		Once		Once		Once		Once	
		2 + 3		2 + 3		2 + 3		2 + 3	
		4 + 10+		4 + 10+		4 + 10+		4 + 10+	
		Male		Male		Male		Male	
		Female		Female		Female		Female	
		White		White		White		White	
		Non-white		Non-white		Non-white		Non-white	
		A & B		A & B		A & B		A & B	
		C		C		C		C	
		D & F		D & F		D & F		D & F	

MINNEAPOLIS PUBLIC SCHOOLS
Department of Guidance Services

JUNIOR HIGH QUESTIONNAIRE

To the student:

The counseling department is interested in knowing how students feel about the junior high counseling program. It will be helpful if you answer as thoughtfully and as honestly as possible the questionnaire on the back.

Since individual students will not be identified, do not put your name on your paper. If you object to answering a question you may skip it.

Check only one answer for each question.

To provide your counselor with information about student feelings, please identify your present counselor according to the code given you. (Omit this item if you do not get special instructions.)

____ 1.
____ 2.
____ 3.

____ 4.
____ 5.
____ 6.

JW/ja
5/2/72

School _____ (71-73) Grade _____ (26-27)

Listed below are some ways that counselors can be helpful. For each item, check the one column that best describes your contact with your counselors in Grades 7, 8 and 9.

MY COUNSELOR HELPED ME	Yes, My Counselor Helped Me	I Didn't Want or Need Help In This Area	I Wanted Help, But Didn't Get It
1. Learn more about my abilities and interests	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
2. Think about my future education and career opportunities	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
3. Plan what subjects to take	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
4. Get a program change	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
5. Learn about or participate in something special (WOC, WECEP, CAMP, NYC, Urban Arts, Talented Youth, Summer School, a meeting)	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
6. Understand how to get along better with classmates or teachers or family	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
7. By helping classmates or teachers or family understand me better	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
8. With a personal problem	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
9. Make an important decision	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
10. Contact a person who could help me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
11. Feel better about coming to school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____

For each of the following phrases, check the column that best describes your present counselor. Your choices are Yes, No, and Don't Know. (Check only one answer for each item).

MY COUNSELOR	YES	NO	Don't Know
12. Cares about me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
13. Is a person I can trust	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
14. Is easy to get in to see	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
15. Listens to me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
16. Is a person I enjoy talking with	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
17. Knows what he is talking about	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
18. Has visited my classes	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
19. Has involved me in group counseling sessions	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
20. Has talked with my parents	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
21. How many times have you "talked" with a counselor during junior high? (Include seventh and eighth grade even if you had a different counselor)			
1. Never			
2. Once			
3. 2-3 times			
4. 4-9 times			
5. Ten or more times			
22. What is your sex?			
1. Male			
2. Female			
23. What is your race?			
1. Black American			
2. American Indian			
3. Spanish Surnamed American			
4. Oriental American			
5. White American			
6. Other			
24. Which of the following best describes the average grades you get in school?			
1. A			
2. B			
3. C			
4. D			
5. F			
25. If you have any additional comments, please write them in the blank space at the bottom of the other side of this sheet.			

MINNEAPOLIS PUBLIC SCHOOLS
Department of Guidance Services

SENIOR HIGH QUESTIONNAIRE

To the student:

Please think about the counselor or counselors that you have had during tenth, eleventh and twelfth grades as you answer the questionnaire on the back. It will be helpful to your school if you will answer as thoughtfully and as honestly as possible.

Since individual students will be graded, do not put your name on your paper. If you object to answer, you may skip it.

Check only one answer for each question.

To provide your counselor with information about student feelings, please identify your present counselor according to the code given you. (Omit this item if you do not get special instructions.)

____ 1.
____ 2.
____ 3.

____ 4.
____ 5.
____ 6.

JW/ja
5/2/72

School _____ (71-73) Grade _____ (26-27)

Listed below are some ways that counselors can be helpful. For each item check the column that best describes your contact with your counselor.

MY COUNSELOR HELPED ME	Yes, My Counselor Helped Me	I Didn't Want or Need Help In This Area	I Wanted Help, But Didn't Get It
1. Plan what subjects to take	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
2. Get a program change	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
3. See a college representative	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
4. See a vocational-technical school representative	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
5. Get information about a job or an apprenticeship	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
6. Apply for admission to college or vocational-technical school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
7. Apply for financial aid (Scholarship)	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
8. By arranging for me to attend a career or another important meeting	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
9. Feel better about coming to school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
10. With a personal problem	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
11. Learn about my abilities and interests	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
12. Make an important decision	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
13. Get along better with classmates or teachers or family	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____

For each of the following phrases, check the column that best describes your present counselor. Your choices are Yes, No, and Don't Know.

MY COUNSELOR	YES	NO	Don't Know
14. Is a person I can trust	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
15. Listens to me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
16. Helps me learn to make my own decisions	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
17. Is easy to get in to see	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
18. Knows what he's talking about	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
19. How many times have you "talked" with your counselor during the school year 1971-72?			
1. Never	_____	_____	_____
2. Once	_____	_____	_____
3. 2-3 times	_____	_____	_____
4. 4-9 times	_____	_____	_____
5. Ten or more times	_____	_____	_____
20. What is your sex?			
1. Male	_____	_____	_____
2. Female	_____	_____	_____
21. What is your race?			
1. Black American	_____	_____	_____
2. American Indian	_____	_____	_____
3. Spanish Surnamed American	_____	_____	_____
4. Oriental American	_____	_____	_____
5. White American	_____	_____	_____
6. Other	_____	_____	_____
22. Which of the following best describes the grades you get in school?			
1. A	_____	_____	_____
2. B	_____	_____	_____
3. C	_____	_____	_____
4. D	_____	_____	_____
5. F	_____	_____	_____
23. What do you plan to do next year?			
1. Full-time job	_____	_____	_____
2. Military service	_____	_____	_____
3. Technical, vocational or business school	_____	_____	_____
4. College	_____	_____	_____
5. Other	_____	_____	_____
24. If you have any additional comments please write them in the blank space at the bottom of the other side of this sheet.			